

The House met at 1:00 P.M.

Prayers.

### **POINT OF PRIVILEGE**

A. MacMaster, House Leader for the Official Opposition, rose on a point of privilege relating to the Leader of the Official Opposition not having been permitted to move an amendment to Bill 243 earlier in the day before the Law Amendments Committee as having his motion to defer consideration of the amendment after the public hearings on the bills on the agenda were received. He requested the decision of the Committee to report the Bill back to the House without amendment be reconsidered and overturned and the bill returned to the Law Amendments Committee.

Hon. G. MacLellan, Government House Leader, responded stating the actions of the Leader of the Official Opposition were to delay proceedings before the committee, that the public would have not been able to speak if the Leader had been given the opportunity to speak for hours and that CHW on Bills was available to make amendments and to debate them fully.

T. Houston, Leader of the Official Opposition, received permission at the beginning of the committee meeting to proceed in the proposed fashion and not given the chance to speak as advance amendment by the Chair contrary to advice given by Legislative Counsel.

K. Irving, Vice-chair of the Law Amendments Committee, stated as chair he was faced with a difficult decision. After the Leader of the Official Opposition said he would speak for hours, he decided that the public should be heard and that the appropriate place for amendments is at CWH on Bills.

A. MacMaster, House Leader for the Official Opposition, stated that a good chair follows the House rules – they were not followed in this case and the rules need to be followed.

The Speaker took the matter under advisement.

### **POINT OF ORDER**

S. Craig, Sackville-Cobequid, rose on a Point of Order relative to Question Period on Thursday, March 5<sup>th</sup> alleging the Premier during Question Period implied that the Leader of the Opposition “was not a good human being” and later in the day again in Question Period told the member to “imagine his motive”. He requested the Speaker have the

Premier withdraw the comments and apologize to the House and the Leader of the Official Opposition.

The Premier responded and stood by his comments but apologized if anyone was offended by his comments.

S. Craig responded that it was an attack on the Leader of the Official Opposition and he stood by his remarks.

The Speaker took the matter under advisement.

### **PRESENTING AND READING PETITIONS**

K. Irving, Kings South, tabled a petition requesting the Government of Nova Scotia and all MLAs to ensure the ban on flavoured e-cigarettes and juices and implement legislative changes to combat youth vaping.

L. Roberts, Halifax Needham, tabled a petition requesting the Premier and MLAs make public plans for the QEII hospital re-development, pass protection for the Halifax Common and revisit the plan to demolish the Halifax Infirmary's Robie Street parking facility and retain it instead.

### **PRESENTING REPORTS OF COMMITTEES**

Hon. M. Furey, as Chair of the Law Amendments Committee, reported that the committee had met and considered the following bills and recommended the same to the favourable consideration of the House, without amendments:

**No. 241. Change of Name Act**

**No. 242. Protecting Access to Reproductive Health Care Act**

**No. 243. Financial Measures (2020) Act**

**No. 246. Opioid Damages and Health-care Costs Recovery Act**

The foregoing bills were ordered referred to the Committee of the Whole House on Bills.

**POINT OF ORDER**

A. MacMaster rose on a point of order because of the point of privilege raised earlier in the day was relative to Law Amendments Committee.

The Speaker took the tabling of the report from the Law Amendments Committee under advisement.

**TABLING REPORTS, REGULATIONS AND OTHER PAPERS**

Hon. M. Furey, Attorney General and Minister of Justice, tabled amendments to the Civil Procedure Rules – Rule 91 (December 18, 2019), Rule 24 (January 24, 2020), Miscellaneous (January 24, 2020) and Unified Family Court Rules (February 21, 2020).

**GOVERNMENT NOTICES OF MOTION**

Pursuant to the order, the following notices were passed in at the Clerk's table:

Res. No. 1861 – Hon. K. Regan, Minister responsible for the *Advisory Council on the Status of Women Act* – recognizing International Women's Day as an opportunity to advance gender equality for all women and girls in Nova Scotia.

With the unanimous consent of the House, the usual two days' notice was waived and the motion carried nem con.

Res. No. 1862 – Hon. K. Colwell, Minister of Fisheries and Aquaculture – recognizing A.F. Theriault Shipyard as an innovative business and exporter.

With the unanimous consent of the House, the usual two days' notice was waived and the motion carried nem con.

Res. No. 1863 – Hon. K. Regan, Minister responsible for the *Advisory Council on the Status of Women Act* – thanking the staff and members of the Nova Scotia Advisory Council on the Status of Women for the important work they do.

With the unanimous consent of the House, the usual two days' notice was waived and the motion carried nem con.

Res. No. 1864 – Hon. I. Rankin, Minister of Lands and Forestry – congratulating David Currie on his retirement as President of the Nova Scotia Bird Society after 37 years with the Society.

With the unanimous consent of the House, the usual two days' notice was waived and the motion carried nem con.

Res. No. 1865 – Hon. R. Delorey, Minister of Health and Wellness – congratulating Cassidy Megan, founder of Purple Day, on realizing her dream to raise awareness and support for epilepsy around the world.

With the unanimous consent of the House, the usual two days' notice was waived and the motion carried nem con.

Res. No. 1866 – Hon. K. Colwell, Minister of Fisheries and Aquaculture – thanking North Bay Fishermen's Co-operative in Antigonish County on 84 years of providing quality seafood products.

With the unanimous consent of the House, the usual two days' notice was waived and the motion carried nem con.

### **INTRODUCTION OF BILLS**

The following bills were introduced by the following Members, read a first and ordered to be read a second time on a future day:

**No. 250. An Act to Amend Chapter 26 of the Acts of 2019, the Sustainable Development Goals Act and Chapter 1 of the Acts of 1994-95, the Environment Act**

**(G. Burrill – Halifax Chebucto)**

**No. 251. An Act Respecting Energy Efficiency**

**(S. Leblanc – Dartmouth North)**

### **SUPPLY UNTO HER MAJESTY**

On motion that the House resolved itself into a Committee of the Whole on Supply, a debate ensued during which the following took part: T. Rushton. The question being put by the Speaker, the motion carried.

The Speaker left the Chair.

The Chairperson took the chair of the Committee.

On motion, the following Resolutions were called:

No. E37, E44 and E47, relating to the Department of Transportation and Infrastructure Renewal. ADJOURNED.

On motion, the Committee rose and the Speaker resumed the Chair. The Chair reported that the Committee had made progress and begged leave to sit again.

### **COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE HOUSE ON BILLS**

On motion, the House resolved itself into a Committee of the Whole House on Bills.

The following bills were carried without debate and without amendments:

#### **No. 234. House of Assembly Act**

#### **No. 238. Insurance Act**

The following bill was debated and after an amendment on Clause 2 carried, the bill carried:

#### **No. 236. Railways Act**

The House reconvened and the Chair reported that the Committee had met and considered the foregoing bills and recommended the same to the favourable consideration of the House. The bills were ordered to be read a third time on a future day.

### **SPEAKER'S RULING**

Earlier today the Official Opposition House Leader rose on a point of privilege relating to the proceedings before the Law Amendments Committee. I have taken extensive time and reviewed the video of the proceedings, and I will now deliver my ruling.

At the very beginning of the Law Amendments Committee meeting earlier today the Leader of the Official Opposition made a motion to defer the consideration of his proposed amendment to Bill No. 243 until after the hearing from all the scheduled witnesses on all of the bills on the committee's agenda. The Chair of the committee agreed but did not put the motion to a vote or seek the consent of the committee.

After the sole witness of Bill No. 243 made her presentation, the Chair recognized the member for Hants East who put forth a motion for Bill No. 243 to be reported to the House without amendments. Some debate ensued.

At the request of the member for Hants East on a point of order, the Chair immediately put the motion to a vote without further debate, and

the motion was passed. The Leader of the Official Opposition and the member for Kings North attempted to raise points of order but were not recognized by the Chair, who proceeded to hear the witnesses on the next bills.

Under normal circumstances the Speakers in this House have ruled that committees are masters of their own domain. In the committee, procedural matters are to be dealt with by the committee. Having said that, there is a precedent in this House of a similar case from June 21, 2001, when Speaker Scott was faced with a similar situation, and that ruling has guided me today.

I want to caution this House that matters such as this would, and normally should, be dealt with by the committee itself. However, Speaker Gosse in his ruling of November 8, 2012, when referring to the 2001 decision of Speaker Scott, stated: "Clearly there could be exceptional and extreme circumstances that could warrant consideration of a point of privilege arising from a committee, raised by an individual member."

I find this case before me today to be an exceptional and extreme circumstance. I therefore find that in this case there is a prima facie breach of privilege. I remind all members of the House that it is not for me to decide whether the incident would constitute a breach of privilege; that is for this House to decide. Normally in raising a point of privilege the member doing so proposes a resolution referring the matter to a committee. In our House that would normally be the Internal Affairs Committee. However, the remedy sought in this case by the Official Opposition House Leader is in effect to refer the bill back to the Law Amendments Committee.

The motion before the House is to refer the bill back to the Law Amendments Committee. Would all those in favour of the motion please say Aye. Contrary minded, Nay.

There has been a request for a recorded vote.

On a recorded vote, there being 22 for and 24 against, the motion was defeated.

#### **SPEAKER'S RULING**

Earlier today when the Chair of the Law Amendments Committee reported the bills back to the House, I took the matter under advisement. Given the outcome of the motion seconds ago, I now accept the report and refer those bills to the Committee of the Whole House on Bills.

**ADJOURNMENT**

On the motion for adjournment, there was a request for a recorded vote. The bells rung for one hour. On a recorded vote, there being 26 for and 16 against, the motion carried.

The Speaker adjourned the House to meet Monday, March 9<sup>th</sup> at 11:00 A.M.

**NOTICES OF MOTION UNDER RULE 32**

The following notices were passed in at the Clerk's table:

Res. No. 1867 – G. Burrill, Halifax Chebucto – congratulating the Halifax Hawks Atom AA Dixon on their hard-won victory at the Tom Saunders Memorial Hockey Tournament.

Res. No. 1868 – Hon. K. Colwell, Preston-Dartmouth – recognizing and congratulating Barb Pate for her valuable contributions to the community and church.

Res. No. 1869 – Hon. K. Colwell, Preston-Dartmouth – recognizing and congratulating Carolann Dixon for her contributions to the community and church.

Res. No. 1870 – Hon. K. Colwell, Preston-Dartmouth – recognizing and congratulating the Cherry Brook United Baptist Church Men's Brotherhood Group on their ongoing efforts to address issues of men's health.

Res. No. 1871 – Hon. K. Colwell, Preston-Dartmouth – recognizing and congratulating Dr. John Smith on his stellar career and for providing excellent medical care to the residents of our communities.

Res. No. 1872 – Hon. K. Colwell, Preston-Dartmouth – recognizing and congratulating Ethen Firth for his outstanding achievements and wish him every success in the future.

Res. No. 1873 – Hon. K. Colwell, Preston-Dartmouth – recognizing and congratulating Cst. Justin Simmonds for serving as a positive role model and for his ongoing commitment to the children of the community.

Res. No. 1874 – Hon. K. Colwell, Preston-Dartmouth – recognizing and congratulating Trevor Silver on his success and for his contributions to the economy of Nova Scotia.

Res. No. 1875 – Hon. K. Colwell, Preston-Dartmouth – recognizing and congratulating Olivia Alspach and the entire U12 Eastern Shore “Gold Diggers” Girls Softball team on their positive contribution to the community.

Res. No. 1876 – J. Lohr, Kings North – thanking the Kings Legion Branch 006 for all their hard work and service to the community.

Res. No. 1877 – K. Masland, Queens-Shelburne – congratulating and thanking students from Liverpool Regional High School for raising funds for the Queens County Community Food Bank.

Res. No. 1878 – K. Masland, Queens-Shelburne – congratulating and thanking Dennis McCann of Shelburne Regional High School for raising funds for the Shelburne Lions Club by selling miniature Christmas trees.

Res. No. 1879 – K. Masland, Queens-Shelburne – congratulating and thanking school counsellor Shannon Davis and Principal John Roscoe of Hillcrest Academy in Shelburne for launching the Free Store to provide for those in need.

Res. No. 1880 – K. Masland, Queens-Shelburne – congratulating and thanking Kiefer Huskins of the Liverpool Privateer Junior B Hockey Club for raising funds for a fellow cancer patient.

Res. No. 1881 – Hon. I. Rankin, Timberlea-Prospect – congratulating the Halifax County United U17 AAA girls team for winning the championship and representing Nova Scotia at the Club Nationals in PEI.

Res. No. 1882 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of James Albert LeBlanc.

Res. No. 1883 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of Joseph Michael Clement Marchand.

Res. No. 1884 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of Janet Marie MacIntyre.

Res. No. 1885 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of J. Conrad Linloff.

Res. No. 1886 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of John Wayne Masters.



Res. No. 1887 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of John Ranald MacKinnon.

Res. No. 1888 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of John Michael O’Brien.

Res. No. 1889 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of James Edward “Jim” Holloran.

Res. No. 1890 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of John F. Green.

Res. No. 1891 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of Joseph Gerald (Jerry) Doiron.

Res. No. 1892 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of John Joseph (Johnny) Breau.

Res. No. 1893 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of Judith Louise (Judy) Kawaja Proctor.

Res. No. 1894 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of Jessie Ann MacKinnon.

Res. No. 1895 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of Jenny Agnes George.

Res. No. 1896 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of Joseph Alexander “Tye” Marchand.

Res. No. 1897 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of Joseph Edwin “Joe” Decoste.

Res. No. 1898 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of James “Jimmy” Nicholas Benoit.

Res. No. 1899 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of James Arthur Desmond.

Res. No. 1900 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of Joseph Thilmond Landry.

Res. No. 1901 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of Joseph Alfred Martell.

Res. No. 1902 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of Joseph Etienne Sampson.

Res. No. 1903 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of John Philip Cotie.

Res. No. 1904 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of John Edward MacIntosh.

Res. No. 1905 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of Joseph Alexander Doyle.

Res. No. 1906 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of John Robert “Robie” MacDonnell.

Res. No. 1907 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of Joseph Ovide Samson.

Res. No. 1908 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of Joseph Roy Richard.

Res. No. 1909 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of Joseph Rudolph Boudreau.

Res. No. 1910 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of John Joseph Ulysse Doiron.

Res. No. 1911 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of Joseph Cornelius Marchand.

Res. No. 1912 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of John Clifford “Jackie” Boudreau.

Res. No. 1913 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of Joseph Helaire Marchand.

Res. No. 1914 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of Justin V.J. “Pooze” Sampson.

Res. No. 1915 – A. Paon, Cape Breton-Richmond – honouring and commemorating the life of Joseph Edwin “Joe” Decoste.