

The House met at 2:00 P.M.

Prayers.

### **GOVERNMENT MOTIONS**

Pursuant to the notice tabled on March 28, 2013, Hon. Maureen MacDonald, Minister of Finance, moved the following Resolution:

Res. No. 39 – Estimates: Committee of the Whole House on Supply

“Mr. Speaker, I have the honour, by command, to present a message from His Honour the Lieutenant Governor of the Province of Nova Scotia relating, to the Estimates of Sums required for the service of the Province for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2014, which is:

‘I hereby transmit Estimates of Sums required for the Public Service of Province, for the year ending March 31, 2014, and in accordance with the Constitution Act, 1867, recommend them together with the Budget Address of my Minister of Finance and any resolutions or bills necessary or advisable to approve the Estimates and implement the budget measures to the House of Assembly.

(Signed)

**J.J. Grant**

**Lieutenant Governor**

**Halifax, N.S.  
April 4, 2013”**

The same Honourable Minister then tabled the message from His Honour the Lieutenant Governor transmitting the Estimates for the consideration of this House, the Estimates Book, the Crown Corporation Business Plans, the Crown Corporation Business Plans Resolutions, delivered the Budget Speech and moved that the Estimates of Sums required for the service of the Province for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2014, being Supply to be granted to Her Majesty, and the Crown Corporation Business Plans be referred to the Committee of the Whole House on Supply. A debate ensued during which the following took part: D. Whalen, who adjourned the debate.

**SPEAKER'S RULING**

“On Tuesday, the honourable Government House Leader raised a point of order with respect to a question posed to him by the honourable Member for Dartmouth East during question period. The Government House Leader said that the Member had imputed motives to him in that question and asked me to review Hansard as to what was said.

I have reviewed Hansard from Tuesday and have seen that, in the question I believe is at issue, the Member for Dartmouth East raised the point that the Treasury Board, of which the Government House Leader, as Deputy Premier, is chair, had not approved an increase to the Auditor General's budget that had been recommended by the Special Committee to Review the Estimates of the Auditor General and the Chief Electoral Officer.

The Member had said ‘Mr. Speaker, is the Deputy Premier just trying to get back at the Auditor General for embarrassing him?’ Imputing that the honourable Government House Leader took revenge upon the Auditor General for carrying out his duties by using the budget process to reduce the Auditor General's budget is a very serious allegation. It is unparliamentary and contrary to convention and usage for any Member to impute to another Member bad motives, or motives different from those acknowledged by that other Member, with respect to anything said or done by that other Member.

*Beauchesne*, on page 141 states that ‘...a Member, while speaking, must not impute bad motives or motives different from those acknowledged by a Member.’ *Beauchesne* goes on to say at page 142 that ‘...a Member will not be permitted by the Speaker to... impute to any Member or Members unworthy motives for their actions in a particular case.’

The meaning of the phrase ‘impute bad motives’, as used in the parliamentary context, is sometimes questioned. Often, it is not clear that the imputation being complained of is one of bad motives when a complaint is raised that another Member is ‘imputing motives’. It is assumed when that phrase is used, that the motives are bad or different from any motives that may have been acknowledged.

The Parliament of Canada publishes a *Glossary of Parliamentary Procedure*, which defines to ‘impute motives’ as to ‘...ascribe objectionable motives or motives to a Member different from those acknowledged by the Member.’ Their underlying principle is that one Member should not allege that another Member has said or done something for an unworthy or hidden

purpose.

It is well established in this House that it is not acceptable to impute improper motives to another Member. I draw Members' attention to a ruling by former Speaker Russell on May 20, 1999, in which he stated that alleging a Member is saying something because he has a vendetta against somebody for something they have done, is imputing motive.

On Tuesday, the honourable Opposition House Leader countered the point of privilege by saying that the Member for Dartmouth East was not making a direct allegation imputing motives but had been asking a question that the Government House Leader, in his capacity as Deputy Premier, could answer.

It is clear from Beauchesne that questions that impute motives to a Member are out of order in the same manner as a direct allegation imputing motives. At page 121 it states '...a question must adhere to the proprieties of the House, in terms of inferences, imputing motives or casting aspersions upon persons within the House or out of it.'

For examples in this House, Members can see the ruling of Speaker Russell on April 6, 1999, ruling a question out of order because it imputed motives, or the ruling of Speaker Scott on April 20, 2004, to the same effect.

Accordingly, I find the suggestion made in Question Period on Tuesday by the Member for Dartmouth East that the Deputy Premier had abused his position as Chair of Treasury Board to exact revenge on the Auditor General to have imputed motives, and that the honourable Member should retract any such suggestion."

A. Younger, Dartmouth East, retracted the question.

#### **POINT OF ORDER**

Hon. M. Samson, Richmond, rose on a point of order concerning the reversal by the Treasury Board of a decision that had been made by the House of Assembly Management Commission, which he tabled.

Comments were made by Hon. F. Corbett.

Hon. The Speaker took the matter on advisement.

**TABLING REPORTS, REGULATIONS AND OTHER PAPERS**

Hon. Maureen MacDonald, Minister of Finance, tabled an Order in Council dated April 4, 2013 – Additional Appropriations (2012-13).

**GOVERNMENT NOTICES OF MOTION**

Pursuant to the order, the following notices were passed in at the Clerk's table:

Res. No. 115 – Hon. D. Peterson-Rafuse, Minister of Community Services – congratulating Wee Care Centre on their 40<sup>th</sup> anniversary and thanking everyone who made Wee Care the success it is today.

With the unanimous consent of the House, the usual two days' notice was waived and the motion carried nem con.

Res. No. 116 – Hon. D. Wilson, Minister of Health and Wellness – recognizing April as Oral Health Month and encouraging everyone to make the health of their teeth and gums a priority.

With the unanimous consent of the House, the usual two days' notice was waived and the motion carried nem con.

Res. No. 117 – Hon. S. Belliveau, Minister of Fisheries and Aquaculture – congratulating the Dalhousie Centre of Water Resources Studies on receiving their Water Resources Award.

With the unanimous consent of the House, the usual two days' notice was waived and the motion carried nem con.

Res. No. 118 – Hon. L. Preyra, Minister of Communities, Culture and Heritage – recognizing Nancy Radcliffe and everyone who helped to comprise the Two Houses Theatres Company.

With the unanimous consent of the House, the usual two days' notice was waived and the motion carried nem con.

**INTRODUCTION OF BILLS**

The following bills were introduced by the following Members, read a first and ordered to be read a second time on a future day:

**No. 33. An Act to Ensure a Supply of Physicians in Rural**

**Nova Scotia****(Hon. S. McNeil – Annapolis)****No. 34. An Act to Protect Nova Scotia Electricity Ratepayers and Reduce Charges Passed on to Customers in Electricity Bills****(A. Younger – Dartmouth East)****NOTICES OF MOTION**

Pursuant to the order, the following notices were passed in at the Clerk's table:

Res. No. 119 – Hon. D. Dexter, Cole Harbour – recognizing the strength, dedication and positive attitude of Larry Foster, showing you can have great success and happiness while living with disabilities.

With the unanimous consent of the House, the usual two days' notice was waived and the motion carried nem con.

Res. No. 120 – K. Regan, Bedford-Birch Cove – thanking Jennifer and Michael Howell for their contributions to the community over the years and wishing them well on their move to Ontario.

With the unanimous consent of the House, the usual two days' notice was waived and the motion carried nem con.

Res. No. 121 – E. Orrell, Cape Breton North – congratulating Joe Peck on receiving a \$20,000 prize for the Northside District Minor Hockey Association.

With the unanimous consent of the House, the usual two days' notice was waived and the motion carried nem con.

Res. No. 122 – Hon. J. MacDonell, Hants East – congratulating Pat Mills on being honoured by National Gypsum for his years of service.

With the unanimous consent of the House, the usual two days' notice was waived and the motion carried nem con.

Res. No. 123 – Z. Churchill, Yarmouth – congratulating and recognizing Nicole Gushue for the dedication and perseverance of running

the Boston Marathon in memory of her cousin, Mark.

With the unanimous consent of the House, the usual two days' notice was waived and the motion carried nem con.

Res. No. 124 – J. Boudreau, Guysborough-Sheet Harbour – congratulating Jeanie Hart from the Royal Bank for her dedication to her community.

With the unanimous consent of the House, the usual two days' notice was waived and the motion carried nem con.

Res. No. 125 – G. MacLellan, Glace Bay – congratulating Justine Williamson on making the final round of the MUCH MUSIC VJ Search.

With the unanimous consent of the House, the usual two days' notice was waived and the motion carried nem con.

Res. No. 126 – K. Regan, Bedford-Birch Cove – congratulating Scott Norton, Q.C. on being awarded the SMU Alumni Association Distinguished Community Service Award.

With the unanimous consent of the House, the usual two days' notice was waived and the motion carried nem con.

## **PUBLIC BILLS**

Hon. J. MacDonell, Minister of Service Nova Scotia and Municipal Relations, moved second reading of the following bill:

### **No. 32. Solemnization of Marriage Act**

A debate ensued during which the following took part: A. MacMaster and Hon. J. MacDonell in Reply. The question being put by Mr. Speaker, the bill was forthwith read a second time and ordered referred to the Committee on Law Amendments.

## **ADJOURNMENT**

Mr. Speaker adjourned the House to meet Friday, April 5<sup>th</sup> at 9:00 A.M.

## **MOTIONS UNDER RULE 5(5)**

Mr. Speaker interrupted the business having received notices of motion under Rule 5(5). The topic of late debate as submitted by K. Regan, Bedford-Birch Cove:

“Therefore be it resolved that the Minister of Education's request to halt school closures, after months of tumultuous school reviews in communities across the province, and \$65 million in funding cuts, is an empty political move that shows no respect for public education or communities.”

A debate ensued during which the following took part: K. Regan, G. Ramey and E. Orrell.

### **NOTICES OF MOTION UNDER RULE 32**

The following notices were passed in at the Clerk's table:

Res. No. 127 – Hon. K. Casey, Colchester North – congratulating Ross Hayman on being added to the Dalhousie's Faculty of Agriculture Dean's List.

Res. No. 128 – Hon. K. Casey, Colchester North – congratulating Thomas Harrington on being added to the Dalhousie's Faculty of Agriculture Dean's List.

Res. No. 129 – Hon. K. Casey, Colchester North – congratulating Ashley McDonald on being added to the Dalhousie's Faculty of Agriculture Dean's List.

Res. No. 130 – Hon. K. Casey, Colchester North – congratulating Carling Gratto on being added to the Dalhousie's Faculty of Agriculture Dean's List.

Res. No. 131 – Hon. K. Casey, Colchester North – congratulating Christopher Howse on being added to the Dalhousie's Faculty of Agriculture Dean's List.

Res. No. 132 – Hon. K. Casey, Colchester North – congratulating Crystal Fullerton on being added to the Dalhousie's Faculty of Agriculture Dean's List.

Res. No. 133 – Hon. K. Casey, Colchester North – congratulating Joshua Chapman on being added to the Dalhousie's Faculty of Agriculture Dean's List.

Res. No. 134 – Hon. K. Casey, Colchester North – congratulating Nicole Cox on being added to the Dalhousie's Faculty of Agriculture Dean's List.

Res. No. 135 – Hon. K. Casey, Colchester North – congratulating Shelby Jamieson on being added to the Dalhousie's Faculty of Agriculture Dean's List.

Res. No. 136 – Hon. K. Casey, Colchester North – congratulating Sherisse Smith on being added to the Dalhousie's Faculty of Agriculture Dean's List.

Res. No. 137 – Hon. K. Casey, Colchester North – congratulating William MacKenzie on being added to the Dalhousie's Faculty of Agriculture Dean's List.

Res. No. 138 – A. Younger, Dartmouth East – congratulating Elvera Ross and staff at Ebony Hair Salon on ten years in business.